

1 **MCCAULLEY LAW GROUP LLC**
JOSHUA V. VAN HOVEN (CSB No. 262815)
2 E-Mail: josh@mccaulleylawgroup.com
3001 Bishop Dr., Suite 300
3 San Ramon, California 94583
Telephone: 925.302.5941

4 **RICHARD T. MCCAULLEY** (*pro hac vice*)
5 E-Mail: richard@mccaulleylawgroup.com
180 N. Wabash Avenue, Suite 601
6 Chicago, Illinois 60601
Telephone: 312.330.8105

7 *Attorneys for Plaintiff and Counter-Defendant,*
8 **SURGICAL INSTRUMENT SERVICE COMPANY, INC.**

9
10 **UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT**
NORTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA
11 **SAN FRANCISCO DIVISION**

12 **SURGICAL INSTRUMENT SERVICE**
COMPANY, INC.

13 *Plaintiff/Counter-Defendant,*

14 v.

15 **INTUITIVE SURGICAL, INC.**

16 *Defendant/Counterclaimant.*

CASE NO. 3:21-CV-03496-AMO

Honorable Araceli Martínez-Olguín

**PLAINTIFF SIS's RESPONSE TO
DEFENDANT INTUITIVES'
ADDENDUM REGARDING SIS'S
MOTIONS IN LIMINE NOS. 1 AND 5
AND INTUITIVE'S MOTION IN
LIMINE NO. 4**

1 There is no dispute that the type of services offered by SIS have never been “approved”
 2 by Intuitive. *E.g.*, Dkt. 321 at 36:14-37:16. Intuitive’s **stated** and **demonstrated** desire in
 3 making the March 2023 statement was to force third parties to obtain costly and unnecessary
 4 510(k) clearances. *See id.* at 39:9-11 (“And then we said: **If somebody gets FDA clearance,**
 5 **that's good enough for us.**” (emphasis added)); Dkt. 245-1 at 4:16-5:6. Intuitive’s newly-
 6 cited franchisee cases are inapposite, at least because the contracts had clear approval
 7 processes. *Betaseed, Inc. v. U & I Inc.*, 681 F.2d 1203, 1224 (9th Cir. 1982); *Photovest Corp.*
 8 *v. Fotomat Corp.*, 606 F.2d 704, 722 (7th Cir. 1979). Intuitive’s contract provides no
 9 mechanism for obtaining its approval for the repair of EndoWrists and its litigation-inspired
 10 “option” for authorized repair as of March, 2023, is illusory.¹ *See Mozart Co. v. Mercedes-*
 11 *Benz of N.A., Inc.*, 593 F. Supp. 1506, 1517 (N.D. Cal. 1984); *U.S. v. Mercedes-Benz of N.A.,*
 12 *Inc.*, 517 F. Supp. 1369, 1382-83 (N.D. Cal. 1981). Intuitive still does not provide any
 13 approval path for third-party EndoWrist repair of the type performed by SIS.

14 SIS does not dispute the unremarkable need for “proof that damages were caused by
 15 illegal acts[.]” *City of Vernon v. S. Cal. Edison Co.*, 955 F.2d 1361, 1372 (9th Cir. 1992).²
 16 Here, SIS has not “fail[ed] to compete” but rather has been absolutely barred from competing.
 17 Intuitive’s “announcement” is a ligation-concocted continuation of its illegal conduct, and
 18 unsupported by FDA. *Cf.*, Dkt. 204 at 13:2-4. Intuitive still has not explained how its website
 19 “announcement” overrides contrary contract terms. *Compare* Dkt. 228 at 10:1-11:12:2 *with*
 20 Dkt. 230-50 at 10:6-13; *and* Dkt. 245-1 *with* Dkt. 249-1. Nor has it explained how a single
 21 FDA-approved remanufactured Si EndoWrist is relevant to competition in a fair and open
 22 EndoWrist repair market.³ *Compare* Dkt. 245-1 *with*; Dkt. 249-1 at p. 7 n.6; *and* Dkt. 321 at
 23 37:21-38:2 *with id.* at 38:19-40:19.

24
 25 ¹ *See* Decl. of David Rosa. Dkt. 137-2 at ¶ 46 (“any means **not** cleared by FDA [is] unlawful”).

26 ² *City of Vernon* does not discuss the “but for” world, and the ABA article supports SIS.

27 ³ Rather, Intuitive’s stated purpose is to present a prejudicial FDA sideshow. Dkt. 231 at 40:6-
 28 11 (seeking to present “28-page” FDA letter to jury); *id.* at 41:22-25 ([T]hey're going to be
 claiming to the jury we had no basis for worrying about patient safety. . . And, respectfully, we
 did have a basis for that because our product had FDA clearance”) *id.* at 44:3-6 (“when we
 said, ‘Iconocare, you can sell it,’ it shows that we are being motivated by patient safety”).

1 Dated: December 3, 2024

2 McCAULLEY LAW GROUP LLC
By: /s/ Joshua Van Hoven
3 JOSHUA V. VAN HOVEN (CSB 262815)

4 E-Mail: josh@mccaulleylawgroup.com
5 3001 Bishop Dr., Suite 300
6 San Ramon, California 94583
7 Telephone: 925.302.5941

8 RICHARD T. MCCAULLEY (*pro hac vice*)
9 E-Mail: richard@mccaulleylawgroup.com
10 180 N. Wabash Avenue, Suite 601
11 Chicago, Illinois 60601
12 Telephone: 312.330.8105

13 *Attorneys for Plaintiff and Counter-Defendant,*
14 SURGICAL INSTRUMENT SERVICE
15 COMPANY, INC.
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28